

# Transportation Report

February 1, 2012

Diana F. Rigby, Superintendent of Schools

John F. Flaherty, Deputy Superintendent of Finance & Operations

# Transportation Report

## Department Overview

- 36 buses and drivers, 3 mechanics, 3 administrators
- Bus repair and maintenance building
- Bus parking area
- Administration building
- Fuel storage & pumping facility

Combined CPS & CCRSD FY2013 budget of \$1,895,120

Combined Budgets for Benefits \$290,000

Total Cost \$2,185,120

# Transportation Report

## Timeline

- Summer 2011 – CCHS building project design and site selection discussion indicate transportation facility may be affected
- Impact and options assessment initiated
- August 2011 - Administration retains consultant for bid development to outsource bus operations as a potential option

# Transportation Report

September 28, 2011

- MSBA commits \$28M to \$92.5M CCHS building project with location that impacts transportation facility
- Impact to transportation operation is now definite

October 5, 2011

- Transportation staff notified of range of changes being assessed

# Transportation Report

October 2011 – Bus bid specifications developed

- Specifications required to mirror existing level of service and routes to minimize impact for students and parents and to provide fair cost comparison to school system operation
- School system will retain ownership of school bus fleet for future flexibility

# Transportation Report

## CPS/CCRSD Transportation Bid Timeline

- 11.7.2011 Legally required advertisement
- 11.16.2011 Mandatory Pre-Bid Meeting Held
  - 12 bus companies attend
- 12.7.11 Bids are due; 2 companies submit bids
- 12.8.2011 Bids are analyzed and First Student is determined to be responsive and responsible bidder with lowest cost of \$1,811,829

# Transportation Report

- Option 1
  - Retain ownership of fleet
  - Retain bus maintenance & bus operations
  - Use Town facility at Keyes Rd.
    - Town facility not available

# Transportation Report

- Option 2
  - Retain ownership of fleet
  - Retain bus maintenance & bus operations
  - Rent maintenance & bus operations facility
    - New Costs: \$50,000 - \$65,000 per year

# Transportation Report

- Option 3
  - Retain ownership of fleet
  - Retain bus maintenance & bus operations
  - Relocate maintenance & bus operations
    - New Costs: \$1.2M to \$1.3M Capital Investment

# Transportation Report

- Option 4
  - Retain ownership of fleet
  - Retain bus operations
  - Outsource bus maintenance
    - New Costs: \$215K to \$300K per year

# Transportation Report

- Option 5
  - Retain ownership of fleet
  - Outsource bus maintenance
  - Outsource bus operations
    - Savings: \$373K per year

# Transportation Report

- First Student Reference Checks
  - Sudbury: “First Student has been above average, very smooth operation, minimal problems, responsive at all levels, continues to save us money.”
  - Lincoln-Sudbury Regional: “very smooth day to day operations, very few problems compared to having overseen a district operated system ...., in Watertown went from in district operation to contracted, contracted was absolutely better ... very good maintenance, minimal breakdowns, very accommodating to our schedule changes, good longevity with drivers”
  - Wayland: “First Student has improved the quality of our fleet, ... minimal breakdowns, good fleet performance, they do a good job on safety training, ... makes good suggestions and has continued to save money.”

# Transportation Report

- First Student & Safety – Transports 5,000,000 students per day, awarded National Safety Council’s Green Cross Safety Award – the highest safety award in North America
- Student, Parent, Community Awareness Campaigns
- Safety is First Student’s Guiding Core Value
  - First Student is, “... committed to safety, not because we ought to be, but because we *want* to be.”

Linda Burtwistle, President, First Student Inc.

# Transportation Report

- First Student in Massachusetts

- ❖ Over Forty Communities

Abington Public Schools	Abington, MA	Leominster Public Schools	Leominster, MA
Applewild School	Fitchburg, MA	Lincoln-Sudbury RSD	Sudbury, ma
Ashburnham-Westminster RSD	Ashburnham, MA	Middleborough Public Schools	Middleborough, MA
Assabet Valley Regional Vocational-Technical High School	Marlborough, MA	Milton Public Schools	Milton, MA
Baypath Regional Vocational-Technical School	Charlton, MA	Mohawk Regional School District	Shelburne Falls, MA
Belchertown Public Schools	Belchertown, MA	Nashoba Regional School District	Bolton, MA
Berlin-Boylston RSD	Boylston, MA	Nauset Regional Schools	Orleans, MA
Brockton Public Schools	Brockton, MA	Newton Public Schools	Newtonville, MA
Chelmsford Public Schools	Chelmsford, MA	North Andover Public Schools	Andover, MA
Chicopee Public Schools	Chicopee, MA	Northboro-Southboro RSD	Southborough, MA
Dennis-Yarmouth RSD	South Yarmouth, MA	Palmer Public Schools	Palmer, MA
Dudley-Charlton RSD	Dudley, MA	Pathfinder Regional Vocational-Technical HS	Palmer, MA
Duxbury Public Schools	Duxbury, MA	Pentucket Public Schools	West Newbury, MA
Easton Public Schools	Easton, MA	Plymouth Public Schools	Plymouth, MA
Essex Agriculture Tech	Hathorne, MA	Randolph Public Schools	Randolph, MA
Falmouth Public Schools	East Falmouth, MA	Sandwich Public Schools	Sandwich, MA
Fitchburg Public Schools	Fitchburg, MA	Springfield Public Schools	Springfield, MA
Gann Academy	Waltham, MA	Stoughton Public Schools	Stoughton, MA
Gardner Public Schools	Gardner, MA	Sudbury Public Schools	Sudbury, ma
Georgetown Public Schools	Georgetown, MA	Ware Public Schools	Ware, MA
Granby Public Schools	Granby, MA	Wayland Public Schools	Wayland, MA
Hingham Public Schools	Hingham, MA	Westborough Public Schools	Westborough, MA
Holbrook Public Schools	Holbrook, MA	Weymouth Public Schools	Weymouth, MA
Holyoke Public School	Holyoke, MA	Whitman-Hanson RSD	Whitman, MA

# Transportation Report

January 2012- Administration concludes internal assessment of school system operated transportation service delivery options

- Impact of losing in-house repair capabilities
  - Increased cost of bus repairs \$215K - \$300K
- Cost of building in house capabilities determined as \$1.2 to \$1.3M without land cost
  - Bus Repair Garage \$400K
  - Paving & Parking Infrastructure \$375K
  - Fuel Tanks & Pumps \$225K
  - Relocate or Replace Admin Building \$185 - \$300K

# Transportation Report

## Savings With Contractor Operated Fleet

	<u>Savings</u>	
- Inhouse Cost		\$2,185,120
- Contractor Cost		<u>\$1,811,829</u>
	<u>Savings</u>	<u>\$373,291</u>

# Transportation Report

## Conclusions

- Annual Savings with Contractor \$375K
- Contractor does not require \$1.2M capital cost
- FY2013 budgets do not include \$285K for purchasing 3 new buses

# Transportation Report

<b>School Bus Survey</b>				
<b>12/20/2011</b>				
<b>District</b>	<b>Own/Operate Fleet (y or n)</b>	<b>Charge Fee (y or n)</b>	<b>Fee Details</b>	<b>Vendor</b>
Acton	y	n	no fees	N/A
Carlisle	n	y	Free for students K-6; fees for all 7-8 riders: 1st child \$395; each additional child \$197.50;no family cap. Reduced or waived fees may be considered for eligible families.	Bedford Charter
Lincoln	n	y	Free for students K-6, >2 miles; fees for <2 miles and all 7-8 riders: 1st child \$275; 2nd child \$200; 3rd child \$100; family cap \$575. Reduced or waived fees may be considered for eligible families.	Doherty Garage
Sudbury	n	y	Free for students K-6, >2 miles; fees for <2 miles and all 7-8 riders: \$350 per child, family cap \$635. Financial assistance/scholarships available.	First Student
Bedford	n	n	no fees	Bedford Charter
Lexington	n	y	Free for students K-6, >2 miles; fees for <2 miles and all 7-8 riders: \$550 per child pre May 27 and \$600 post May 27, family cap \$1,600. \$275 each additional route. Financial assistance available.	C&W Transportation
Needham	n	y	Free for students K-6, >2 miles; fees for <2 miles and all 7-8 riders: K: \$185 one-way, \$370 round trip pre June 13, post is \$210 and \$420. 1-8: \$370 per child pre May 1 and \$420 post May 1, family cap \$750 pre and \$750 plus \$50 post. Financial assistance available.	Connolly, Local Motion
Wayland	n	y	Free for students K-6, >2 miles; fees for <2 miles and all 7-8 riders: \$180 per child pre June 30 and \$230 post June 30, family cap \$500. Financial assistance available.	First Student
Wellesley	n	y	Free for students K-6, >2 miles; fees for <2 miles and all 7-8 riders: 1st child \$512; family cap \$1,124. Reduced or waived fees may be considered for eligible families.	Eastern Bus
Weston	y	n	no fees	N/A